

## **SCRUTINY BOARD (CITY DEVELOPMENT)**

**WEDNESDAY, 7TH SEPTEMBER, 2016**

**PRESENT:** Councillor P Truswell in the Chair

Councillors D Cohen, R Grahame, G Latty,  
S Lay, A Ogilvie, D Ragan, C Towler,  
P Wadsworth and J Walker

### **18 Declaration of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests**

There were no disclosable pecuniary interests declared to the meeting.

### **19 Apologies for Absence and Notification of Substitutes**

Apologies for absence were submitted by Cllr P Davey and Cllr E Taylor. Cllr E Taylor was substituted by Cllr R Grahame.

### **20 Minutes - 20 July 2016**

**RESOLVED** – That the minutes of the meeting held on the 20 July 2016 be approved as a correct record.

### **21 Draft Terms of Reference - Inquiry into Transport for Leeds - Supertram, NGT and Beyond**

The Head of Scrutiny submitted a report which outlined the draft terms of reference for the Scrutiny Inquiry into Transport for Leeds – Supertram, NGT and Beyond.

The following representatives were in attendance to respond to Members queries and comments:

- Sandra Pentelow – Principal Scrutiny Advisor
- Gary Bartlett – Chief Highways Officer, City Development
- Dave Haskins – West Yorkshire Combined Authority
- Cllr Richard Lewis – Executive Board Member, Regeneration Transport and Planning

**RESOLVED** – The Scrutiny Board:

- a) Agreed the noted the terms of reference for the inquiry.
- b) Noted that the terms of reference may incorporate additional information during the inquiry should the Scrutiny Board identify any further scope for inquiry or request further witnesses or evidence.

## 22 Scrutiny Inquiry Session - Transport for Leeds - Supertram, NGT and Beyond

The Director of City Development and the West Yorkshire Combined Authority submitted a report which provided the Scrutiny Board with background information on the development of Supertram and NGT. The report also provided some information regarding some of the issues that arose during the NGT project and an update on the emerging transport strategy.

The following information was appended to the report:

- Appendix 1 – The Local Partnerships Gateway Report, February 2013
- Appendix 2 – DfT rejection letter from Martin Woods, 12 May 2016
- Appendix A: Atkins Report: Study of High Quality Buses in Leeds
- Appendix B: Response from Metro on the Atkins Report
- Appendix C: Transport in Leeds, Consultation Questionnaire
- Appendix D: Gateway Review- Actions Undertaken
- Appendix E: Background to the Economic Impacts Assessment
- Appendix F :SDG Report (Jan 2014); Wider Economic Impacts
- Appendix G: Commentary on the individual decision points
- Appendix H: Sub – mode options report
- Appendix I: email from the Project Director to DfT

The following representatives were in attendance to respond to Members queries and comments:

- Gary Bartlett – Chief Highways Officer, City Development
- Dave Haskins – West Yorkshire Combined Authority
- Cllr Richard Lewis – Executive Board Member, Regeneration Transport and Planning

The key areas for discussion were:

- A presentation outlining the chronology of the NGT project and the various phases in the development of submissions and outcomes.
- The response to the Atkins report regarding the proposed bus alternative, the rationale for a bus based system following that response, and the lack of alternative options provided by government.
- An update on the consultation plan to inform the submission of an outline business case for transport. This will be presented to Executive Board in October 2016 and will seek to secure £173.5m of funding from Government also in October 2016. Confirmation about this funding should be announced in the Autumn Statement.
- The Board requested information and responses provided to WYCA and Leeds City Council from the Department of Transport about the NGT project.
- Clarity was sought about the independent panel of experts due to be set up, and the track records of the advisors used previously. This information will be provided to the Scrutiny Board.

- Clarity was sought about the Inspectors reservations about local funding, if future projects have to be profitable, and if there will potentially be a funding gap for future schemes.
- The need not to be constrained in ambition due to finance during early consultation and the intention to bring together a Transport Strategy for the next 20 years. The Board were advised that the Bus Strategy and Transport strategy under consultation will be aligned to bring a cohesive strategy together which should have the support of the City.
- The purpose of the Gateway Review, which looked at key themes giving cause for concern at the time.
- The gap between the advice given by DfT and meeting the expectations of the Planning Inspector. The perception that Leeds has fallen short in nearly every heading in the report. Clarity was sought about the preparation for the depth of inquiry, and if this should have been expected.
- The importance and need for public support in any future schemes, with promotion of the benefits to the areas along and neighbouring identified routes.
- The need for the Scrutiny Board to be advised about the lessons learned by Leeds City Council and WYCA which was lacking in the report provided. This information will be provided at a future meeting.
- Governance of transport at a local level and the opportunities that could be available through devolution.
- The Board requested further information about current technologies that are non-bus based for a future meeting.
- The preparation of a letter to the DfT about the differences in advice given and the response by the Inspector, the contradictions and the apparent disconnect.

**RESOLVED** – The Scrutiny Board:

- a) noted the comments in the report of the Director of City Development and WYCA
- b) requested that the information required be provided at a future session of the inquiry.

**23 Work Schedule**

A report was submitted by the Head of Scrutiny which detailed the Scrutiny Board's draft work programme for the current municipal year.

The draft Scrutiny Board (City Development) work schedule for 2016/2017 and the Executive Board minutes for 27 July 2016 were appended to the report.

Sandra Pentelow, Principal Scrutiny Adviser, presented the report and responded to Members' queries and comments.

**RESOLVED** - The Scrutiny Board noted the content of the report and agreed the work program.

Minutes approved as a correct record  
at the meeting held on Wednesday, 12th October, 2016

**24 Date and Time of Next Meeting**

Wednesday, 12 October 2016 at 10:30am (pre-meeting for all Board Members at 10:00am)

The meeting concluded at 12:40pm